Establishing Established:

Reversed Remediation in Broersen and Lukács' 'Establishing Eden'

By Saskia Isabella Maria Korsten, University of the Arts (ArtEZ), The Netherlands

Abstract:

Artists Persijn Broersen and Margit Lukács, reveal the way the New Zealand landscape is appropriated by Hollywood movies such as 'The Lord of the Rings' and 'The Hobbit.' In Establishing Eden (2016), the viewer becomes trapped in a perpetual establishing shot through a collage of two-dimensional photographic clips. Eventually, it displays the naked structure of how Establishing Eden is constructed from flat database images taken from the 'library' of a digital video editing program. Whilst some of the scenery images maintain a coherent illusion of an unspoiled landscape by using the structure of a tracking shot, the flipping image clips reveal a two-dimensional diorama. Therefore, looking at Establishing Eden with this oscillation in mind, the film seems to produce what Ruskin might mean with his "third way" of treating a surface. The depth of its conventional structure shines through the exposed flatness of the image.

In this paper, I relate Broersen and Lukács' work to my notion of reversed remediation in which hypermediacy generates an oscillation space between what Bolter and Grusin call remediation and reversed remediation.

Keywords:

Establishing shot, remediation, reversed remediation, hypermediacy, structure, surface, imperial landscape, appropriation, diorama, ornament, motif, pattern, meta-realism, immersion.

But if Pasteur and Robespierre are right that we can resist poison only through certain built-in poison, then some specific frustrations, caused by cybernated life, require accordingly cybernated shock and catharsis.

— Nam June Paik

Poison Resisted

The artists Persijn Broersen and Margit Lukács employ immersive strategies in their digital video installations. For instance, they borrow techniques used in mainstream cinema to invoke a sense of immediacy. In 'Establishing Eden' (2016), they examine and reveal the conventions of an establishing shot. In all their works, however, the illusive machinations do not hold completely. I am interested in the way they propel viewers out of immersion and pull them back in again. This oscillation, as I will argue, exemplifies what I have coined *reversed remediation* as another possible outcome of media theorists Jay David Bolter and Richard Grusin's notion of *remediation.* [1] [2] According to Bolter and Grusin, remediation serves a historical desire for immediacy; hypermediacy is its *modus operandi* through which seamless transitions between different media are realized. Video artist Nam June Paik has stated that "we can resist poison only through certain built-in poison."[3] If for instance, as media theorist Wendy Chun has argued, Big Data is being filtered by Prototypian logic, then Machine Learning amalgamates digital and analog traits according to Bolter and Grusin's mechanism of remediation and thus obfuscating its construction.[4] If, in a hybrid world with analog and digital traits, works like Broersen and Lukács' 'Establishing Eden,' reveal these sorts of constructs using the same hypermediacy but with reversed remediation as its outcome, potential poison is resisted with built in-poison. In the last section, I address the specific poison resisted in 'Establishing Eden': the appropriation of the New Zealand landscape by the Hollywood movies 'The Lord of the Rings' and 'The Hobbit.'

---

[1] Saskia Isabella Maria Korsten, "Reversed Remediation; How Art can make one critically Aware of the Workings of Media" (Master of Arts Thesis, University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 2010). dare.uva.nl/document/188776 (published January 17, 2014, accessed November 20, 2017).

[2] Jay David Bolter and Richard Grusin, "Remediation," *Configurations,* vol. 4. 3 (Fall 1996): 311-358.

[3] Nam June Paik, "Cybernated Art," *Manifestos, Great Bear Pamphlets* (New York, NY: Something Else Press, 1966).

[4] Wendy Hui Chun, "Crisis + Habit = Update," at *Sonic Acts Festival – The Noise of Being* (The Netherlands: Sonic Acts, 2017). https://vimeo.com/208744281 (accessed January 8, 2018).

Establishing Shot

Eden is established in a God-like perspective by a soaring camera which proceeds relentlessly in a ten-minute digital tracking shot.[5] The camera skims over an iconic landscape. Rocks, mountain peaks, clouds, and foliage are all flattened on a backdrop which resembles the film set of director Peter Jackson's Hollywood fantasy trilogies 'The Lord of the Rings' and 'The Hobbit'.[6] In 'Establishing Eden' Broersen and Lukács, reveal the way the New Zealand landscape is appropriated by these Hollywood movies (Fig. 1).

[Figure 1]

Figure 1. Still. 'Establishing Eden,' Persijn Broersen and Margit Lukács, 2016.

Establishing shots usually involve a view of a distance framed in a wide shot, which allows viewers to orientate themselves to the filmic space and introduce the key elements of the narrative.[7] In the case of 'The Lord of the Rings', one of the establishing shots is used as an introduction to an un-spoilt fantasy landscape in which Gandalf (one of the protagonists in the movie) on his horse-drawn carriage is introduced (Fig. 2).

[Figure 2]

Figure 2. An establishing shot from 'The Lord of the Rings.'

By using a mobile frame, a point of view is presented as well. When the point of view moves from the sky towards the scene (sometimes even accompanied by a voice over), one approaches the narrative from an auctorial perspective, which becomes the viewer's perspective: the camera lens becomes one's eyes. This generates a gap between the 'down-to-earth' information the actual characters in the scene have and the viewer's information about the spatial relations between context, characters and objects. The mobile frame takes the viewer on a journey within the scene; one becomes immersed within it. Tracking shots supply continually changing perspectives of passing objects and make them appear more solid and

---

[5] Bordwell and Thompson define a tracking shot as a mobile framing that travels through space forward, backward, or laterally. David Bordwell and Kristin Thompson, *Film Art, An Introduction, Eight Edition* (New York, NY: McGraw-Hill, 2008), 481.

[6] 'The Lord of the Rings' trilogy with: The Fellowship of the Ring (2001), The two Towers (2002), and The Return of the King (2003), by Peter Jackson. The Hobbit trilogy with: An unexpected Journey (2012), The Desolation of Smaug (2013), and The Battle of the Five Armies (2014), by Peter Jackson.

[7] Bordwell and Thompson, Film Art, An Introduction, 478.

three-dimensional when the camera arcs around them.[8] Moreover, by using tracks to move the camera or by using a Steadicam, one's auctorial distance to the narrative remains intact.[9] One is lured into the world of the narrative, but one does not become part of it, as would be the case with a hand-held camera in a documentary-style film.

In 'Establishing Eden' the viewer, however, becomes trapped in a perpetual establishing shot. One is offered an un-spoilt scenic landscape repeatedly (Fig. 3). The landscape appears familiarly strange; one recognizes similar landscapes produced by Hollywood film studios (Fig. 4).

[Figure 3]

Figure 3. Still. 'Establishing Eden,' Broersen and Lukács, 2016.

[Figure 4]

Figure 4. Abandoned Hobbit holes near Matamata in 2006.

The tracking shot in 'Establishing Eden' insists upon a mobile frame which remains in motion for a full ten minutes and then continues in a loop. In the beginning it may feel natural, like the usual mobile frame establishing shot, but because of its relentless continuous movement and the absence of some sort of characters, it becomes denaturalized.

The James Bond-film 'Spectre' (2015), directed by Sam Mendes, begins with an unusually long establishing tracking shot of more than six minutes (Fig. 5). This shot introduces the setting of the narrative and establishes the spatial relations between protagonist and antagonist in one take. Viewers are confronted with a huge skull moving towards them while being in the midst of a Day of the Dead Parade in Mexico. The camera then takes the viewer up via an elevator scene and through a hotel window onto a rooftop. The action increases in tempo with Bond scurrying across rooftops; granting us an overview of the parade taking place in the streets below. After a shoot-out and buildings collapsing, the viewer is transported down, along with Bond, to street-level amidst the parade. The camera movements of zooming, panning and craning at different speeds makes the scene feel natural.

---

[8] The working of a zoom lens differs from mobile framing since it brings objects closer to the viewer but would not bring the viewer closer to the object and would not increase information about the space of the image but rather, increase information about the details of the object.
[9] Of course, in animation, the 'camera' can stay in one position, but by shooting individual cels frame by frame, the animator can create the effect of camera movement.

Undoubtedly, the shot could never have been created in one take and cinematographer Hoyte van Hoytema has used several tricks to hide cuts, in order to retain the illusion of a seamless take.

[Figure 5] [Figure 6]

Figure 5. 'Spectre,' technical point of view.   Figure 6. 'Birdman,' technical point of view.

The same is the case for 'Spectre's' inspirational film: 'Birdman or (The Unexpected Virtue of Ignorance)' (2014) directed by Alejandro González Iñárritu. The style of cinematography makes it look like one long continuous take spanning the entire film, this contributed to its winning the Oscar for 'Best Cinematography' in 2015 (Fig. 6). Naturally, Director of Photography Emmanuel Lubezki was required to employ pans, wipes and CGI (Computer Generated Imagery) to generate this illusion. In an interview Iñárritu explains why he wanted the entire film to look and feel like a one-taker:

> The most difficult decision for a director is always the point of view. I knew that I wanted to put the audience in the point of view of that guy [the main character]. […] [I]n his mind in his point of view in the way we live with open eyes and we are navigating all the time in our life without the possibility of cutting. We don't cut it. We use editing to remember our lives […] that's why we are so addicted to fiction, because that makes us escape from our own tunnel that is just one single shot all our life. […] This thing [the long take] was an extension of his mental state to reach the audience in that way.[10]

In Broersen and Lukács' 'Establishing Eden' the distance towards some kind of personage is not diminished; a particular protagonist within the presented landscape is not even introduced. One becomes aware that it must be the landscape itself or, as I will argue later, the personage might be a *human-scape* or even one's own *innerscape*. The constant movement of closing-in on and then passing-by a different landscape, prevents the viewer from becoming familiar with it. One is merely superficially allowed to scan the surface. It recalls a few minutes at the beginning of 'Kooyaanisqatsi' (3"45-10"00), directed by Godfried Reggio (1982). Director of Photography Ron Fricke, not coincidently, is the so-called master of time-lapse photography.

---

[10] Taken from an interview with the Los Angeles Times, from 0:40 minutes to 2:02 minutes. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D4qKyNU5u6M (accessed November 21, 2016).

[Figure 7]

Figure 7. Still. 'Koyaanisqatsi,' Godfrey Reggio, 1982.

Viewers are immersed within a six-minute-long shot of a desolate landscape and allowed a penetrating view between the parched rocky formations (Fig. 7). The soundtrack of the film was created by minimal music composer Philip Glass. The incessant repetition of the melodic structure and the chanting of Hopi aborigines enhances the state of immersion which had already been activated by the continuous tracking shot from an auctorial point of view. Here, the landscape is introduced as the main personage. It is presented as a cradle of life which has been knocked out of balance by the actions of mankind. The landscape itself is shown as unoccupied and unspoiled. Music also plays an equally important role in 'Establishing Eden'. The score by Gwendolyn Thomas and Berend Dubbe is a clear reference to soundtracks of lyrical movies such as 'Kooyaanisqatsi'. It aids the advancement of the tracking shot which flies the viewer over and through the landscape, similar to Nils Holgersson astride Mårten the white goose in Selma Lagerlöf's children's novels.

The visual speed in 'Establishing Eden', however, is a disturbing factor. The pace is set by the soundtrack but the actual speed of the film, is harder to grasp. Since the whole film is not made with a movie camera (no time lapse photography) but made with actual photos without a certain frame-rate, the sense of duration enters a void. With time lapse photography the frame rate gets tampered with, but at least there is a frame rate as some sort of reference point. While one is hovering at a wavering speed and within an infinite space, Broersen and Lukács use their tracking shot not to increase information by giving an enriched three-dimensional body to the objects filmed, but rather, reveal their objects as radical two-dimensional images. Landscapes are flipped while the camera moves in on the scene and arcs around; for example, a mountaintop which, when viewed from the side suddenly appears to be an image of a mountaintop on a flat surface (Fig. 8). Their shot gives away that a tracking shot may suggest a three-dimensional perspective but is indeed the result of a sequence of two two-dimensional still images projected onto a flat screen.

[Figure 8]

Figure 8. Stills. 'Establishing Eden,' Persijn Broersen and Margit Lukács, 2016.

Reversed Remediation

The contradiction, displayed in 'Establishing Eden', between the operational logic of the tracking shot and its revealing outcome owing to the flipping of images, exemplifies what I call *reversed remediation.*[11] The term *remediation* is explained by Bolter and Grusin in their eponymous article as new media adopting characteristics of old media and, at the same time, presenting these 'old' characteristics as new desirable traits.[12] They argue that in order to be accepted, new media must adopt characteristics of old media, securing a seamless transition in which one can smoothly travel from one situation (the old) to the other (the new). This way, one does not experience the possible stress of suddenly needing to learn new skills (and abolish the old) in order to survive in the world and understand one's perception of it; the new consists of just enough 'old' not to alienate. With the term remediation Bolter and Grusin explain how the adaptation from old media elements in new media is taking place. This adaptation should be executed invisibly to keep the appearance of immediacy (or unmediated presence, or transparency) intact. They argue that remediation is an answer to the long historical desire for unmediated presence (immediacy) and hypermediacy is the method to achieve this desire.

> The desire for immediacy leads to a process of appropriation and critique by which digital media reshape or 'remediate' one another and their analog predecessors such as film, television, and photography (314).

Hypermediacy is a technique that multiplies technologies to accomplish this sense of immediacy. They admit that there are instances in which the medium is foregrounded rather than made transparent. Their examples are drawn for the most part from art history. They mention collages in which the viewer becomes hyperconscious; since one is oscillating between interpreting the paper clippings/torn up photographs and looking through the depicted objects into a real space beyond the surface. They state that hypermediacy in a collage serves the same goal as immediacy through transparency, namely seeking the real; only in this case by creating a satiety of experience. However, they do not explore other possibilities: this oscillation space generates a critique of the medium that is used to contemplate one's own handling of the depicted media. They use the notion of hypermediacy

---

[11] Korsten, Reversed Remediation.
[12] Bolter and Grusin, Remediation.

as a vehicle for explaining remediation, where I use it as a vehicle for explaining what I call, reversed remediation.[13]

In the works of Broersen and Lukács its hypermediacy creates an opportunity to see the media at work. It can interrupt the advancement of remediation, render turbid the metaphorical transparent window between user and medium and make its strategy visible.

[Figure 9]

Figure 9. The role of Hypermediacy in Remediation/Reversed Remediation.

I position hypermediacy at the fulcrum of the oscillation between remediation and reversed remediation, where the movement hovers for a moment and then can be pushed in either direction (Fig. 9). To push it towards remediation, the multiple media used must work together to create a familiar outcome that lulls the user into immersion. To push it towards reversed remediation, the multiple media used must work together to create an unfamiliar (uncanny) outcome that propels the user out of immersion. In 'Establishing Eden', this happens when parts in a moving sequence are flipped and revealed as flat images, calling one's attention to this irreconcilable incongruity.

Regarding technical images, philosopher Vilém Flusser has said that a camera slides between the observer and the image; there are many instances where media are slid between users and their experiences, unnoticeably altering their perception.[14] He argues that when operating a device, a photo camera in his case, it seems that the chain between image and meaning remains unbroken. However, meaning enters the camera on one side and exits out the other, while the operation itself - happening inside the 'black box' - remains obfuscated. "Every examination of technical images should therefore be aimed at bringing to light its inner workings" (16). Broersen and Lukács themselves are concerned about the fact that seen

---

[13] In 'Print is Flat, Code is Deep,' (2004) media theorist Katherine Hayles uses the term "reverse remediation" to exemplify how print books play with remediation's generalizations by making print pages inaccessible for instance. Bolter and Grusin have also already taken into account the reverse of remediation as the "old" adopting the "new", they do not explore this into much detail though. In 'Writing Machines,' (2002), Hayles uses "remediation" for the mechanism of adopting "old" into "new" and "new" into "old" simultaneously. Katherine Hayles, "Print is Flat, Code is Deep," *Poetics Today* 25 (1), (2004): 67-90. Katherine Hayles, *Writing Machines* (Cambridge MA: MIT Press, 2002).

[14] Vilém Flusser, *Een Filosofie van de Fotografie* (Utrecht: Uitgeverij IJzer, 2007).

on the thin, flat screen of one's laptop for instance, the whole three-dimensional world is captured in a false perspective belonging to a two-dimensional viewing device.[15]

Contemporary Diorama

Another striking element in 'Establishing Eden' is the way that clippings of certain elements of the landscape are edited together, similar to glued picture pieces composing an eighteenth-century diorama (Fig. 10).

[Figure 10]

Figure 10. Still. 'Establishing Eden,' Persijn Broersen and Margit Lukács, 2016.

When the continuously-moving camera zooms in on a landscape, it reveals it to be constructed from a virtual three-dimensional space occupied by two-dimensional clippings, like the wings of a stage set depicting scenic elements used as a backdrop for a theatrical production (Fig. 11).

[Figure 11]

Figure 11. Eighteenth-Century tunnel book attributed to Martin Engelbrecht.

[Figure 12]

Figure 12. Engelbrecht's tunnel book after restoration and on display at the Smithsonian Libraries in 2010.

These wings in a décor suggest depth through the use of a vantage point derived from the layers in a scenic landscape (Fig. 12). This is in league with what historian Martin Jay has defined as the dominant scopic regime of Modernity: Cartesian perspectivalism.[16] It is the scopic regime where linear perspective comes to symbolize a harmony between mathematical regularities in optics and God's will. The coldness of the perspectival gaze meant the withdrawal of the painter's entanglement with the objects depicted and was thus in line with a scientific world view which observed objects from without, with the dispassionate eye of a neutral observer. The viewer is presumably outside the viewed scene capturing an eternal moment and its sight is assumed to be unblinking, saccadic (jumping from one focal point to the next rather than panning), and disembodied. Jay cites philosopher Richard Rorty who, via

---

[15] Paraphrased from a transcription of a conversation between Broersen and Lukács and the author, June 21, 2016.

[16] Martin Jay, "Scopic Regimes of Modernity," *Vision and Visuality* (Biloxi, MS: Bay Press, 1988): 3-23.

Descartes, states that knowing is described as gazing with the mind's eye on mental representations that mirror the exterior world.[17]

Nuancing Jay's notions, art theorist Jonathan Crary signals a "passage from the geometrical optics from the seventeenth- and eighteenth-centuries to physiologic optics" (16).[18] Crary understands geometric optics as represented by the figure of the *camera obscura*, which is an object that catches light passing through a small hole into a darkened box which casts an inverted image of the scene onto the back wall of the box. For him this device was, during the seventeenth- and eighteenth-centuries, the most widely used model for explaining human vision (27). Although, already in the eighteenth century, there were instances of noticeable objection to the forms of geometric- and even physiologic optics. Art historian Rod Bantjes draws attention to an eighteenth-century form of spatial projection, which he calls 'hybrid', breaking with Euclidean logic.[19] [20] During the eighteenth century doubts arose about not only "how we 'see' space, but also about how artists might incorporate tactile sensations of ocular and bodily motion as well as time and memory in their depictions of the spatial world. Hybrid projection addressed […] the problem of reducing time and motion in vision to the confines of a static planar surface in exhibition" (913). Bantjes shows that hybrid projections such as *vues d'optique* were part of assemblages which combined embodied practices of viewing with optical machines enabling viewers to move, and to 'feel' depth (915).

[Figure 13]

---

[17] Margaret Atherton describes Jay's Cartesian Perspectivalism as a shorthand way to characterize the dominant scopic regime of the modern era. To her, it is an example of how Descartes is sometimes attributed a role of mythic proportions (139). Margaret Atherton, "How to Write the History of Vision: Understanding the Relationship between Berkeley and Descartes," *Sites of Vision: the Discursive Construction of Sight in the History of Philosophy,* ed. David Michael Levin (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1999): 139-166.

[18] Jonathan Crary, *Techniques of the Observer: On Vision and Modernity in the Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1990).

[19] Rod Bantjes, "Hybrid Projection, Machinic Exhibition and the Eighteenth-Century Critique of Vision," *Art History* 37 (5), (2014): 912-39.

[20] Euclidean logic and Cartesian logic are related terms. Euclidean logic can be explained via Euclidean geometry which is an example of synthetic geometry. René Descartes developed analytic geometry, an alternative method for formalizing geometry which focused on turning geometry into algebra. Robert Florka *Descartes's Metaphysical Reasoning* (New York, NY: Routledge, 2001): 92.
.

Figure 13. Installation shot. 'Liquid Territories,' Broersen and Lukács, 2014.

'Establishing Eden' is not interactive in the sense that one can operate a viewing machine, but it does indeed simulate the experience of being immersed in a diorama. Nevertheless, in some of Broersen and Lukács' other works the projection is positioned in a space similar to a life-sized diorama in which one could actually move between the layers. For instance, in their work 'Liquid Territories' (2014) the viewer is literally allowed to see 'behind the scenes' (Fig. 13).

In 'Establishing Eden' Broersen and Lukács do not hide their montage technique of two-dimensional clippings set in a fictional three-dimensional space, furthermore it encapsulates the unequivocal choices made with the editing program as part of its internal logic. It works much like new media theorist Lev Manovich's description of filmmaker Anatoly Prokhorov's notion of a transparent and opaque computer screen.[21] The projection screens keep shifting, either from a transparent window to an opaque screen; or from a fictional three-dimensional space to a solid flat surface with clipped images. Manovich distinguishes three stages of immersion: the first is complete immersion in a fictional environment without knowledge of the illusionary aspects (early moviegoers)[22]; the second is when a director uses *Verfremdungseffekten*[23] (alienation techniques) in order to direct the viewer's attention to the illusionary aspects; and the third stage of immersion can be reached by the emancipated viewer/user who is confronted with alienation techniques and is fully aware of the illusionary aspects and is still able to maintain a high level of immersion (computer games users).[24] He calls this third stage meta-realism. Exploring this further, one might conclude that the display of the medium itself does not automatically break the spell of immersion, it can sometimes even enhance the sense of immersion. This is exactly what happens in 'Establishing Eden' when the viewer starts oscillating between immersion and awareness and it lays bare the chasm between remediation and reversed remediation. Broersen

---

[21] Lev Manovich, "The Synthetic Image and Its Subject," *The Language of New Media* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2001): 199-211.

[22] Most film historians would immediately nuance this category by arguing that early moviegoers probably were not that naïve. Concurrently, one could argue that, generally, this state of immersion is what is aimed at by mainstream cinema even today.

[23] *Verfremdungseffekten* were invented and used by Bertolt Brecht for his plays. An example can be found in the play *Mutter Courage und Ihre Kinder* (1938-39). The songs in this play are not an integral part of the story but are song-insertions and are actually a danger to the unity of the drama in the sense that they permit a multilayered perception of the drama through their contents which critique or dispute the content of the drama itself. The songs are important instruments of *verfremdetes Theater*; they enable viewers to emancipate themselves. The songs are not entertainment instruments but rather pauses in which insights can be gained.

[24] It might only be a question of time until the statement that, computer game users are fully aware of the illusionary aspects of the game, will become obsolete. This would occur when computer game users no longer discriminate between the control panel and the immersive game space.

and Lukács' works are poising as accomplished tightrope walkers travelling between two poles.

Potential Motif

Another immersive mechanism deployed by Broersen and Lukács is the use of patterns and motifs. They are interested in decorative arts ornamentation and especially in the workings of motifs.[25] In 2010 they created a silkscreen artwork entitled 'The Fallen' (Fig. 14). The fallen man depicted as a digital wire-model (used for computer modelling) is inspired by a documentary photograph captured by Timothy O'Sullivan during the American Civil War. Interestingly, O'Sullivan crafted the image after depictions of fallen men portrayed in historical paintings; indeed he actually repositioned the body for the photograph. Yet, these photographs, amongst others, mark the beginning of the 'documentary-style' war-photography genre.

[Figure 14]

Figure 14. Silkscreen 'The Fallen,' Broersen and Lukács, 2010.

Broersen and Lukács remade this image to include a motif of a reclining man positioned in an Escher-like pattern. The operations of a pattern motif will propel the mechanics of pattern recognition. Humans are able to discern an anomaly within a pattern in the blink of an eye, even the slightest deviation will stand out. Motifs can still be congruent while containing configuration variations but will fall apart by a single difference when its rhythm is disrupted. Pattern recognition suits one when faced with simple problems but lags when it comes to more complex issues. Especially in dangerous situations one uses pattern recognition - a rather intuitive method - to quickly asses one's options. When dealing with classification questions one could compare this to the Prototypical, more informal, as opposed to the Aristotelian, more formal, senses of categorization. Using the Prototypical approach leads to assessments with more conviction and fewer reservations than by using the Aristotelian approach which leaves more room for uncertainty and ambivalence. Specifically, the cases of classification according to race are extremely complex. [26] Media theorist Wendy Hui Chun draws attention to the way that machine learning operates according to the more prototypical classification methods. Consequently, Big Data is pressed into rather shallow categories with

---

[25] From a transcription of a conversation between Broersen and Lukács and the author, June 21, 2016.
[26] Geoffrey C. Bowker and Susan Leigh Star, "Classification and its Consequences," in *The Case of Race Classification and Reclassification under Apartheid* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1999).

the risk of imprinting the data with old prejudices and thus stigmatizing people. [27] Media theorist Katherine Hayles has described what happens in translation from analog to digital media:[28]

> Whenever two material entities interact, analogue resemblance is likely to come into play because it allows one form of continuously varying information to be translated into a similarly shaped informational pattern in another medium. Once this translation has taken place, digital coding is used to transform the continuity of morphological form into numbers (or other discrete codes). Intrinsic to this process is the transformation of a continuous shape into a series of code markers. In contrast to the continuity of analogue pattern, the discreteness of code enables the rapid manipulation and transmission of information. Human readers, with sensory capabilities evolved through eons of interacting with three-dimensional environments, are much better at perceiving patterns in analogue shapes than performing rapid calculations with numbers. When presented with code, humans tend to push toward perceiving it as analogue pattern. (4, 5)

The works of Broersen and Lukács seem to reflect on these systems, using them to lure one into its suturing and intuitive feeling of confidence, but at the same time, propelling one out of it by exposing the exact nature of its superficial and 'quick' workings. They expose the ubiquitous contemporary hybrid between analog and digital systems.

In 'Establishing Eden' they obstruct the smooth operation of a tracking shot by exposing the flatness of the images in a theatrical setting, rather than using it to present a seamless three-dimensional landscape. It is exactly opposite to how a tracking shot tries to mimic one's ability to see a coherent pattern rather than sequential items. What happens here is a display of the mechanics of seeing a motif in a pattern rather than experiencing it unconsciously. Social theorist Brian Massumi explains via philosopher Susanne Langer that in traditional decorative arts and specifically in spiraling vegetal motifs one does not see 'spirals' but instead sees 'spiraling' (72).[29] In one's perception, an actual form and the

---

[27] Chun, Crisis + Habit = Update.
[28] Katherine Hayles, *Flickering Connectivities in Shelley Jackson's Patchwork Girl: The Importance of Media-Specific Analysis* (Baltimore, MD: John Hopkins University Press, 2000).
[29] Arjen Mulder, "An interview with Brian Massumi," *Interact or Die* (Rotterdam: V2_Publishing, 2007): 70-91.

abstract dynamic of inferring the *backedness* (for instance) of it, are two sides of the same coin. They are fused, like two dimensions of the same reality.

> Form is full of all sorts of things that it actually isn't – and that actually aren't visible. Basically, it's full of potential. When we see an object's shape we are not seeing around to the other side; what we are seeing, in a real way, is our capacity to see the other side. We're seeing, in the form of the object, the potential our body holds to walk around, take another look, extend a hand and touch. The form of the object is the way a whole set of active, embodied potentials appear in present experience: how vision can relay into kinaesthesia or the sense of movement, how kinaesthesia can relay into touch. The potential we see in the object is a way our body has of being able to relate to the part of the world it happens to find itself in at this particular life's moment (73).

In 'Establishing Eden' viewers are lured-in and propelled-out of this fusion continuously. When an image fills the whole screen, the illusion of a coherent landscape as a motif is upheld. However, when the image flips and shows its clipped outlines, the coherent motif is split open to reveal its *fragmentedness*. Thus, demasking the conventional tracking shot as a mere technical device for immersion in a fictional 'reality' one should mistake for one's own. The way one encounters 'live' objects is described by Massumi as a form of 'relational potential'. Conventional film premediates this potential in a closed system, it piggybacks onto its workings but does not generate a dynamic outcome. The potential is scripted.

Depth of Surface

The visible editing structure, combined with the masks of images on the surface, appear to be functioning as the surface and depth of the work simultaneously. This resembles social theorist John Ruskin's "third way" of treating surfaces as described by architectural theorist Lars Spuybroek.[30] The first way is to leave the skin undraped, exposing the naked structure, "waving that modernist flag of transparency" (58). The second way is to cast a drape over the structure from the outside, giving the untransformed structure "a (postmodern) mask" (58). According to Spuybroek, mask and skeleton are merely two sides of the same coin. Ruskin's third way proposes a relationship between the first and second way:

---

[30] Lars Spuybroek, *The Sympathy of Things; Ruskin and the Ecology of Design* (Rotterdam: V2_Publishing, 2011).

Ruskin's third way is different, proposing a generative relation between the other two, a process that originates on the inside, as in the first approach, yet is dressed, as in the second. It offers the depth of structure, yet without transparency, and the opacity of the mask, yet without flatness (58).

Spuybroek uses Ruskin's example of the Matterhorn to explain the notion of the *wall-veil* as a relation between massing and texture through interdependence. Forces operate from the inside out (constitution); and from the outside in (erosion); to press the wall veil out of the mountain so to say. The mountain's texture (the wall-veil) is "not merely draped but also encrusted, covered with its own material, in a self-draping, a self-adornment" (80). Spuybroek argues that, although, the display of the internal structure is what modernists call transparency, at the same time is being transformed into drapery while being exposed to forces such as erosion. "Texture guides the shaping of form" (81). Similarly, the flipping of the mountain in 'Establishing Eden' displays the naked structure of how it is constructed from flat images extracted from a database; the library of an editing program. While, at the same time, the continuous tracking shot overlays more landscapes over the previous ones. Paradoxically, it generates an oscillation space between on the one hand, revealing the underlying editing structure and on the other, using exactly this structure to heighten a sense of immersion on the surface of the mechanism. Therefore, when one looks at the mountaintop in 'Establishing Eden' with this oscillation in mind, it seems to do what Ruskin meant with his "third way" of treating a surface. The depth of structure is working hand in hand with the exposed flatness of the image. On the surface of the screen the underlying editing structure outwardly pushes the texture of the created images. The oscillation can now be read as not an undulation between two extreme poles, but rather as a simultaneous shimmering-through of both sides of a coin. Turning the coin opaque; or assuming, with Massumi, the *backedness* of both sides.

Projected in 'News from Nowhere – Acanthus' (2012) the well-known motif of the 'arabesque' becomes a living organism, hovering weightlessly in space (Fig. 15). It moves from background to foreground, between being a flat image and being a spatial figure. Again, Broersen and Lukács play the game of hide-and-seek with surface and structure.

[Figure 15 left] [Figure 15 right]

Figure 15 left and right. Installation shot and detail. 'News from Nowhere – Acanthus,' Broersen and Lukács, 2012.

Furthermore, in 'Stranded Present' (2015) they display a Vertigo-effect of time as they reconstruct the once three-dimensional ruins of Palmyra out of a flat image by Robert Wood from the Parisian Bibliothèque Fornay (a library of decorative arts) into a motif of a ruin, as a liquid body which can transform over time in digital space (Fig. 16 and Fig. 17).[31] The fact that the present is always overlaid with the past becomes palpable. Moreover, the work proves that the present is overlaid by the future as well, especially when ISIS took control of historic Palmyra on the night of the work's first public appearance (Fig. 18). The doubling of time grants it yet another layer of depth.

[Figure 16]

Figure 16. Robert Wood's engraving of Palmyra used as the digital model for 'Stranded Present.'

[Figure 17]

Figure 17. Still. 'Stranded Present,' Broersen and Lukács, 2015.

[Figure 18]

Figure 18. Photograph taken by Joseph Eid after ISIS blew up the 'Triumph's Arc' of Palmyra in October 2015.

I conclude this section, which addressed the workings of digital images, with Hayles explaining via media theorist Espen Aarseth the distinction between the digital image that the viewer sees as scriptons and textons, the strings of binary code of which it consists:

> In electronic media textons and scriptons operate in a vertical hierarchy
> rather than through the flat microscale/macroscale play of stipple engraving.
> With electronic texts there is a clear distinction between scriptons that
> appear on screen and the textons of underlying code, which normally remain

---

[31] The Vertigo effect is a film technique where the camera lens zooms in on the subject, while the camera itself is physically moved away from it simultaneously. It creates a dizzying feeling, comparable to being unable to estimate one's actual distance from a subject.

invisible to the casual user. This difference between print and screenic text

can be summarized by saying that print is flat and code is deep. (5)

'Stranded Present' seems to be a 'deep' work, since the underlying structure of code alters the visible appearance on the surface of the work. It is yet another example of depth of surface notions in the works of Broersen and Lukács.

Appropriated landscape

Following Paik's motto about resisting poison through certain built in poison, in this next section I address the specific poison to be resisted in 'Establishing Eden;' it being the appropriation of New Zealand landscapes by the Hollywood movies 'The Lord of the Rings' and 'The Hobbit.' 'Establishing Eden' is about a 'pristine wilderness.' The detached auctorial point of view suggests the style of a lyrical documentary. Eventually, however, this documentary perception turns out to be highly fictional. This 'fictional turn' reveals how viewers of 'The Lord of the Rings' and 'The Hobbit' perceive the New Zealand landscapes through the lens of a camera and through choices made for them in a video-editing program. In 'Mastering Bambi' (2010), Broersen and Lukács *remade* Walt Disney's 'Bambi' (1942) by undoing the landscape of its inhabitants (Fig. 19). What remains, one could easily guess, is the 'pristine wilderness' without the anthropomorphic elements. The thought-provoking thing is however that the filmic landscape can just as easily be read as the protagonist itself, shaped after a human example. The emotions and narrative can be retold by the images of the landscape through a soundtrack.

[Figure 19]

Figure 19. Still. 'Mastering Bambi,' Broersen and Lukács, 2010.

For 'Establishing Eden' they traveled to New Zealand to face the appropriation of the landscape by Hollywood movies. Sites where scenes from 'The Lord of the Rings' and 'The Hobbit' were shot, are visited *en masse* by tourists with a reverse appreciation of the landscape as a result. Tourists want to see the 'real' environment of the film. They encounter the New Zealand landscape with pre-established images from the films in mind. One is welcomed to film-sites with plaques reading: "Welcome to… Hobbiton". The natural environment is fused with specific filmic memories, leftover props and 'Hobbiton' itself (the village of the Hobbits). Fans are traversing the landscape with a map of 'Middle Earth' while operating their mobile phones and tablets, selecting scenes from the movies which overlap the

exact same spot on the map (Fig. 20). It is even possible to take a tour using an interactive Google map to navigate through Middle Earth (Fig. 21).[32] On this map the fictional landscape can be accessed from the air, as well as through a Hobbit's eyes.

[Figure 20]

Figure 20. Locating movie spots.

[Figure 21]

Figure 21. Screenshot from Google's interactive map of Middle Earth.

Before the movies could even be shot, much mayhem was caused by the role director Peter Jackson played in opposing what he called the "toxic nonsense" of a unionization effort. The New Zealand government has released forty-one pages of previously confidential documents.[33] The documents offer a glimpse behind the scenes of the dispute. The country's government ended up paying Warner Brothers an additional $25 million and pushing through legislation that effectively makes it impossible to unionize motion picture production in the country.

Many of the documents are emails between Jackson and Minister of Economic Development Gerry Brownlee. Jackson referred to the unionization effort as "toxic nonsense" because in his opinion "[i]t is about an Australian trade union making a blatant play to take a controlling hand in the NZ film industry -- for their own political and financial gain." [34] In one of the documents the following bullet points stand out:

> 5. the Government of New Zealand will enter into a strategic partnership with Warner Brothers for the promotion of New Zealand as a destination for future film production (in particular, for films with budgets in excess of US$ 150m).
>
> 6. that Tourism New Zealand will become a strategic partner of Time Warner Global Media Group. This group will work in partnership with Tourism New Zealand to promote New Zealand to the global market place through to the release of the second planned Hobbit movie.

---

[32] One can take a preview tour through the interactive map here:
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BVvMGD8LNL0 (accessed November 18, 2017).
[33] http://static.stuff.co.nz/files/Hobbit-Documents.pdf (accessed December 30, 2017).
[34] http://static.stuff.co.nz/files/Hobbit-Documents.pdf (accessed December 30, 2017).

7. Ministers agreed to pay Warner Brothers US$ 10m (NZ$ 13.358m) on 16 November 2010 for the strategic marketing opportunities for New Zealand associated with the two Hobbit movies.[35]

The New Zealand government has a substantial commercial interest in the movies and actively writes 'Tourism New Zealand' into the deal. Jackson wants flexible immigration laws, so he can fly in actors with non-New Zealand or non-Australian backgrounds on work-visas. The Actors Guild's interest is getting as much New Zealand and Australian actors as possible to work for the movies in order to get access to the actor's residuals (5 to 15 percent of all down-stream earnings) and off course they oppose the liberalization of immigration laws. Jackson claims that the guild (of Australian origin) is trying to get hold of the New Zealand film industry and that a small percentage of the Australian and New Zealand actors are members of the guild.

[Figure 22]

Figure 22. Image taken from the official site of Tourism New Zealand.

[Figure 23]

Figure 23. Image taken from the official site of Tourism New Zealand.

The weapon that Warner Brothers brandished was to threaten to relocate the film to South Wales. This controversy truly turned the landscape into a battleground conquered by Warner Brothers. Jackson could now bring in his 'war-machinery' like cranes, apparatuses, crews and sets, to mask the dispute with a fairytale. For the people aware of and involved with this affair, it turned 'Hobbiton' and other residual movie marks in the landscape into memorial sites marking a battle that took place behind the scenes. This metaphor, of course not intended as such, can also be seen on the Tourism New Zealand website, where the filmset is depicted as a military maquette with 'generals' pointing to certain strategic positions and war-material being set up in the landscape (Fig. 22 and Fig. 23).

Broersen and Lukács have read art historian W.J.T. Mitchell's article 'Imperial Landscape' in which he formulates nine theses on Landscape. Thesis number one reads: "1.

---

[35] Document titled: '29 October 2010 Minister Brownlee Notes for Oral Cabinet Item 2010 (ORAL)- Warner Brothers Agreement.' http://static.stuff.co.nz/files/Hobbit-Documents.pdf (accessed December 30, 2017).

Landscape is not a genre of art but a medium" (5).[36] In this essay Mitchell takes a harder look at the framework in which facts about landscape are constructed, believing that not only landscape painting, but "landscape *perception* is 'invented'" at some point (8). He argues that landscape is already artifice in the moment of its beholding, long before it becomes the subject of pictorial representation, it is a medium in which cultural meanings and values are encoded.

> Landscape mediates the cultural and the natural, or "Man" and "Nature," as eighteenth-century theorists would say. It is not only a natural scene, and not just a representation of a natural scene, but a *natural* representation of a natural scene, a trace or icon of nature *in* nature itself, as if nature were imprinting and encoding its essential structures on our perceptual apparatus. (15)

He examines New Zealand as an imperial landscape viewed through the rear-view mirror of postcolonial understanding. The land is virtually synonymous with pristine natural beauty and as a nation whose principal commodity is the presentation and representation of landscape (20). His reading of Australia as a prison-scape for the incarceration of the British criminal class, and New Zealand as a garden and pasture in which the best elements of British society might grow into an ideal nation, sheds yet another dubious light on the 're-colonizing' of the New Zealand landscape by 'The Lord of the Rings' and 'The Hobbit'. It can now be read as 're-appropriation' of the landscape by yet another British fantasy. Middle-Earth stems from the Middle English word *middel-erde*.[37] Middangeard is said to be derived from Midgard which is a realm in Norse mythology.[38] J. R. R. Tolkien was inspired by Old English Christian

---

[36] W.J.T. Mitchell, "Imperial Landscape," *Landscape and Power*, ed. W.J.T. Mitchell (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2002): 5-34.

[37] Tolkien first encountered the term *middangeard* in Cynewulf's poem 'Christ II' (the ascension) (approximately from the seventeenth century). J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien: First Printing* (London: George Allen and Unwin, 1981).
> [Line 104] Eala earendel, engla beorhtast, (Hail Earendel brightest of angels)
> [Line 105] ofer middangeard, monnum sended, (Above Middle-earth sent unto men)
https://web.archive.org/web/20110519124347/http://www8.georgetown.edu/departments/medieval/labyrinth/library/oe/texts/a3.1.html (accessed December 30, 2017).

[38] It is one of the Nine Worlds—the only one that is completely visible to mankind (the others may intersect with this visible realm but are mostly invisible). The concept of Midgard occurs many times in Middle English. Another early example is from the verse 'the Ormulum' (a twelfth-century work of biblical exegesis, written by a monk named Orm):
> 7 & he þatt all þiss middellærd. d (And He who dresses the middle-earth)
>   Onn alle wise shrideþþ; (in all possible ways)
> He wollde wundenn ben forr uss. e (He would be wound for us)
>   I wrecche winndeclutess. (in wretched swaddling-cloths,)

texts for his 'The Lord of the Rings' setting and positions 'Hobbiton' at the same latitude as Oxford; in the movies it is exchanged for the New Zealand landscape.

Mitchell shows how the route from cultural colonialism and dependency to national independence could be traced in New Zealand landscape painting. With the appropriation of the land by these movies the route might be traversing back to dependency again. With Ruskin, Mitchell reminds us that "the appreciation of landscape as an aesthetic object cannot be an occasion for complacency or untroubled contemplation; rather, it must be the focus of a historical, political, and (yes) aesthetic alertness to the violence and evil written on the land, projected there by the gazing eye" (29). According to Mitchell, landscape is, like Imperialism, an object of nostalgia in a postcolonial and postmodern era, reflecting a time when metropolitan cultures could imagine their destiny in an unbound "prospect" of endless appropriation and conquest (20). The artist Semâ Bekirovic seems to sharply confirm this notion in her video work entitled 'Event Horizon' (2010) (Fig. 24). Bekirovic shows that how we perceive a landscape is, in fact, constructed by convention. In the video one's gaze is captivated by an ever-approaching black dot set within naturalistic scenery; it appears on the middle of the horizon and in the center of the image. It is carried continually closer to the camera and eventually, the only thing left to 'see' is the complete darkness of the dot. The *outerscape* has become *innerscape*; landscape is uncovered as 'human-scape'.

[Figure 24 left] [Figure 24 middle] [Figure 24 right]

Figure 24 left, middle and right. Stills. 'Event Horizon,' Semâ Bekirovic, 2010.

Bekirovic makes one actively aware of this transformation while, simultaneously, the images that one can peruse when googling websites of New Zealand tourist guides show numerous examples of this same transformation (Fig. 25). The 'real' landscape is partly hidden behind still-images of the 'fictional' landscape. The fact that the 'real' landscape was already fictionalized by the first conscious conception of it as a landscape and then again by the appropriation of the British colonizers only to be appropriated once again by Hollywood is

---

Forr þatt he wollde shridenn uss; f (because He wanted to dress us)
  Wiþþ hêfennlike wæde. (with heavenly garments). (H3672–3677)
https://www.britannica.com/topic/Midgard (accessed December 30, 2017).
http://www.orrmulum.net/orrmulum_site.html (accessed December 30, 2017).

obfuscated. Congruently, this is why these images read like recursive movements of the *Droste Effect*.[39]

[Figure 25]

Figure 25. Images taken from numerous tourist websites and blogs.

Another recursive movement is explained by art critic Nat Muller via Broersen and Lukács' work 'Double Mirror' as informed by questions such as the idea of visual representation itself being caught up in a feedback loop (Fig. 26).

[Figure 26 left] [Figure 26 right]

Figure 26 left and right. Stills. 'Double Mirror,' Broersen and Lukács, 2017

The title of the work refers to a looking glass that is transparent on one side but reflective on the other. This work again, refers to Narcissus gazing at his own reflection in the pool, but now this metaphor is turned inside out. What if it is the mirror-image of Narcissus staring back at him from underneath the surface? Muller contends that "[w]ith a plethora of technology that unceasingly relays, quotes, references, embeds and re-tweets, the distinction between the making of images and the way we look at them has profoundly changed. It seems that immediacy and authenticity - in the past rather unusual but by now familiar bedfellows - are promised through the mere act of recycling imagery."[40]

It is also what happened with the New Zealand landscape, as Broersen and Lukács have established with 'Establishing Eden'. The landscape is, just like the water in Ovid's 'Narcissus,' unmasked as a medium through which one views one-self looking at one-self *ad infinitum*.

Aware Unawareness

If audiences hover somewhere between immersion and awareness, viewers are able to see themselves, as media theorist Marshall McLuhan has suggested, as Narcissus, suddenly

---

[39] During the 1970s Nico Scheepmaker, a Dutch journalist and poet, coined the term *Droste Effect* to describe a snapshot of such a recursive movement. This appeared on an old-fashioned looking tin can manufactured by the Droste Cocoa Company on which a nurse is depicted holding a tray displaying a tin can of Droste cocoa, on which the same nurse holding the same tray with the same tin can is to be seen; and so on and so on. Other examples of snapshots of recursive movements are to be seen in M.C. Escher's drawings of a hand drawing itself or in the concept of Russian nested dolls. The movement itself can go on infinitely but it will result in images or objects too small to discern.

[40] As can be read in the portfolio section of the Akinci gallery website, Nat Muller has curated the exhibition where 'Double Mirror' was shown. http://akinci.nl/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/Persijn-Broersen-Margit-Luk%C3%A1cs-2017.pdf (accessed January 7, 2018).

realizing one is actually looking at oneself being reflected.[41] The artwork might then be functioning as mountain nymph Echo in the bushes holding up a concave mirror that distorts the reflection. Hayles has described artist Shelly Jackson's hypertext work 'Patchwork Girl' (1995) and cites Jackson talking about fiction sneaking up on reality.[42] "Jackson remarks that […] there are especially powerful opportunities to 'sneak up on reality from inside fiction to turn around and look back on reality as a text embedded in a fictional universe'" (31).

McLuhan was concerned about viewers becoming closed systems with the *perception-medium* and its power of seduction.[43] As I have argued, the works by Broersen and Lukács actually use this power of seduction, not to imbed the viewer into the work nor to position the viewer outside of it, but to generate some sort of oscillating position in- and outside of it simultaneously. Massumi eloquently explains how art can assist our vision and allow us to see how we see:[44]

> All of this suggests a way of bringing art and "natural" perception together while still having a way of distinguishing them. In art, we see life dynamics "with and through" actual form. Or rather, we always see relationally and processually in this way, but art makes us see that we see this way. It is the technique of […] making an explicit experience of what otherwise slips behind the flow of action and is only implicitly felt. (Massumi, 76)

It is exactly this dynamic oscillating reciprocity between the in- and out-side of an artwork that continuously makes one aware of one's own unawareness.

---

[41] Marshall McLuhan, *Understanding Media: The Extensions of Man* (Berkely, CA: Gingko Press. 2003 [1964]).
[42] Hayles, Flickering Connectivities.
[43] McLuhan, Understanding Media.
[44] Mulder, Interview with Brian Massumi.

<u>Addendum</u>

Links to the tourist websites and blogs for the images on page 26:

1. https://www.backpackerguide.nz/wp-content/uploads/2014/10/Lord-of-the-Rings-Queenstown_optimized.jpg (accessed December 30, 2017).

2. https://pureglenorchy.com/site/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/Isengard-2.jpg (accessed December 30, 2017).

3. https://www.newzealand.com/us/article/top-3-photographed-lord-of-the-rings-locations/ (accessed December 30, 2017).

4. https://www.backpackerguide.nz/wp-content/uploads/2014/10/DSCF8173.jpg (accessed December 30, 2017).

5. https://www.nomadsafaris.co.nz/tours/lord-of-the-rings/glenorchy/ (accessed December 30, 2017).

6. https://scientificnomad.wordpress.com/2012/02/02/the-glenorchy-district-or-paradise/ (accessed December 30, 2017).

7. http://everybodyhatesatourist.net/trip-reports/travel-diaries-photos/queenstown-new-zealand-a-lord-of-the-rings-tour/#.WkfroEmunug (accessed December 30, 2017)

8. https://pureglenorchy.com/portfolio-item/lord-of-the-rings-scenic-tour/ (accessed December 30, 2017).

9. https://www.tripzilla.com/budget-things-to-do-new-zealand/18686 (accessed December 30, 2017).

10. https://www.downunderendeavours.com/packages/new-zealand-highlights-movie-sights (accessed December 30, 2017).

11. https://pureglenorchy.com/10-top-lord-rings-places/j/ (accessed December 30, 2017).

12. http://carolyninaotearoa.blogspot.nl/2010/11/falling-into-middle-earth.html (accessed December 30, 2017).

13. https://www.tripadvisor.com/LocationPhotoDirectLink-g255115-d1236103-i123798618-Flat_Earth_New_Zealand_Experiences-Wellington_Greater_Wellington_North_I.html (accessed December 30, 2017).

14. https://www.tripadvisor.com/LocationPhotoDirectLink-g255115-d1236103-i123798618-Flat_Earth_New_Zealand_Experiences-Wellington_Greater_Wellington_North_I.html (accessed December 30, 2017).

15. http://www.howiechanphotography.com/blog/?p=618 (accessed December 30, 2017).

16. https://miketheguide.com/category/lord-of-the-rings/ (accessed December 30, 2017).

List of Figures

Figure 14. Silkscreen. 'The Fallen', Broersen and Lukács, 2010, courtesy the artists and art gallery Akinci.

Figure 15. Installation shot and detail. 'News from Nowhere – Acanthus,' Broersen and Lukács, 2012, courtesy the artists and art gallery Akinci.

Figure 16. Image taken from Robert Wood, *The Ruins of Palmyra and Balbec* (London: William Pickering, 1827).

Figure 17. Still. 'Stranded Present,' Broersen and Lukács, 2015, courtesy the artists and art gallery Akinci.

Figure 18. Photograph taken by Joseph Eid, 2015. https://www.cbsnews.com/pictures/palmyra-destruction-temple-bel-triumph-arch-isis-before-after/2/ (accessed January 14, 2018).

Figure 19. Still. 'Mastering Bambi,' Broersen and Lukács, 2010, courtesy the artists and art gallery Akinci.

Figure 20. Locating movie spots. http://www.fodors.com/news/following-the-hobbit-trail-in-new-zealand-6576 (accessed November 18, 2017).

Figure 21. Screenshot from Google's interactive map of Middle Earth. http://www.dailymail.co.uk/sciencetech/article-2511261/Google-Middle-earth-Interactive-3D-map-J-R-R-Tolkiens-imagined-kingdom-launches-run-Hobbit-film-release.html (accessed November 18, 2017).

Figure 22. Image taken from the official site of Tourism New Zealand. https://www.newzealand.com/uk/feature/the-lord-of-the-rings-trilogy-filming-locations/ accessed November 18, 2017).

Figure 23. Image taken from the official site of Tourism New Zealand. https://www.newzealand.com/uk/feature/the-lord-of-the-rings-trilogy-filming-locations/ (accessed November 18, 2017).

Figure 24. Stills. 'Event Horizon', Semâ Bekirovic, 2010, courtesy the artist. http://www.semabekirovic.nl/373/ (accessed November 22, 2017).

Figure 25. Images taken from numerous tourist websites and blogs. The links to the websites and blogs can be found in the addendum.

Figure 26. Stills. 'Double Mirror', Broersen and Lukács, 2017, courtesy the artists and art gallery Akinci.